

Prototype Modeling Questions and Answers?

Proposal to use Woodboro WI as a Prototype module for AP Prototype

Please look at the attached link to the Three Lakes Model RR Club  
[www.tlmrc.org](http://www.tlmrc.org) and provide me with suggestions for my Prototype module.

The direct link to the pdf about Woodboro as a prototype module is

<http://www.tlmrc.org/AP/Building%20a%20Prototype%20module%20that%20reflects%20a%20prototype%20location%202X4%20Woodboro%20B.pdf>

The link may be found on the AP page of the TLMRC.org site under Prototype Woodboro

Thanks,

Paul Wussow

Reply from NMRA Frank Koch 8/7/13:

Paul

Let me make this real simple.

There are requirements as to the models necessary to meet the requirements - you got to do this part.

Now, the critical test: you have a photograph(S) of the prototype scene and photographs of the modeled scene. When I look at the two sets of photos, I see the "same" things in both sets of photos. Absolute best case (and it happened once), I confuse the prototype and model photos and cannot tell which is which. The key is that it is the "same" scene in both set of photos...not 100%, but pretty close.

Does that help?

Frank Koch, NMRA AP

My reply:

Yes, I believe it helps me decide to enter the module as Scenery and not Prototype as there are no photos of the areas I model with the necessary equipment present. With sidings now removed and the service terminated to some if not all the locations and a total lack of passenger cars and cabooses in service, taking photos would not be possible.

I will build prototype accurate modules for the club and local museum but collect 4) 2X4 foot modules to be evaluated under Scenery.

Scenery also gives me a bit more freedom of expression and materials than Prototype.

Thanks,

Paul

Later reply by Jack Burgess MMR to a question from across the pond:

You don't need a photo with all of the required elements in it but you do need photos which show that the elements (buildings, locomotives, rolling stock, etc.) in your model scene are prototypical. So, if you model the depot scene per a specific date (general year, time of the year), then the locomotive and rolling stock should be correct for that same date and you need some photos or reference material to show that the prototype operated that locomotive in the same time period. For rolling stock, you don't need photos showing that particular freight car was on the prototype railroad but you do need to be sure that the freight car was in operation at the same time.

Look closely at the depot scene...are there details which you can also model? What about trees, the terrain, etc. Note too what date you are modeling...if the photo is from the 1950s and you can tell that from automobiles which are in the photo but you model a different time, then the automobiles should be correct for the time that you are modeling.

It might help to think about how you would explain the scene to a visitor. You have photos of the depot and general area. Do you have plans or maps or aerial photos of the trackwork? So, you could show the visitor photos, maps, freight car records, the prototype railroad's list of locomotives, etc. and point out all of the things that you did to reproduce the prototype and thus prove to the visitor that the model duplicates the prototype on each point.

I wrote an article for the September 2012 issue of the free, online magazine Model Railroad Hobbyist: <http://model-railroad-hobbyist.com/magazine/back-issues>

Entitled Details from Photos which might give you some more ideas.  
Jack Burgess MMR

My off list reply to Jack:

I agree with what you are saying however this is what I received from Frank back in August and therefore decided to just build scenery. There was no way to get the photos of everything

I send off list. Thanks, Paul

Jack's Reply on AP List:

I'll have to wait to have Frank say that I'm wrong. I have 3,000 prototype photos of the Yosemite Valley RR and I don't think that I have a single photo which shows a railroad structure, at least one freight car, a cabooses, and a locomotive all in the same photo. But I have lots of photos of each of those individual elements.

Jack